

APPENDIX A. SEARCH STRATEGIES

PubMed

1 March 2013-present; English
Search Run: 22 April 2021

Acupuncture
AND
systematic[sb]
AND
("2013/03/01"[PDat] : "3000/12/31"[PDat])

Results: 1165

CDSR

2013-present; English
Search Run: 22 April 2021

acupuncture:ti,ab,kw

Results: 85

DARE (via CRD)

Publication Year 2013 – 2021 (However – ends at 2014 when DARE ceased production)

Any Field: acupuncture
AND
Title: systematic review

Results: 74 – 5 identified non-English = 69

AMED (via Dialog)

1 March 2013 – 22 April 2021; English

ti(acupuncture) AND ("systematic review")
OR
ab(acupuncture) AND ("systematic review")

Results: 148

APPENDIX B. EXCLUDED REVIEWS MEETING ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA NOT INCLUDED IN EVIDENCE MAP

1. Amaral, L.K.B., et al., Efficacy of conservative therapy in older people with nonspecific low back pain: A systematic review with meta-analysis and GRADE recommendations. *Arch Gerontol Geriatr*, 2020. 90: p. 104177.
2. Asher, G.N., et al., Comparative Benefits and Harms of Complementary and Alternative Medicine Therapies for Initial Treatment of Major Depressive Disorder: Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *J Altern Complement Med*, 2017. 23(12): p. 907-919.
3. Bisson, J.I., et al., Non-pharmacological and non-psychological approaches to the treatment of PTSD: results of a systematic review and meta-analyses. *Eur J Psychotraumatol*, 2020. 11(1): p. 1795361.
4. Cheong, Y.C., et al., Acupuncture and assisted reproductive technology. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2013(7): p. Cd006920.
5. Close, C., et al., A systematic review investigating the effectiveness of Complementary and Alternative Medicine (CAM) for the management of low back and/or pelvic pain (LBPP) in pregnancy. *J Adv Nurs*, 2014. 70(8): p. 1702-16.
6. Dai, L., et al., Acupuncture and Derived Therapies for Pain in Palliative Cancer Management: Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis Based on Single-Arm and Controlled Trials. *J Palliat Med*, 2021.
7. Deare, J.C., et al., Acupuncture for treating fibromyalgia. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2013. 2013(5): p. Cd007070.
8. Gao, R., et al., Acupuncture and clomiphene citrate for anovulatory infertility: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Acupunct Med*, 2020. 38(1): p. 25-36.
9. Gutke, A., et al., Treatments for pregnancy-related lumbopelvic pain: a systematic review of physiotherapy modalities. *Acta Obstet Gynecol Scand*, 2015. 94(11): p. 1156-67.
10. He, Y., et al., Clinical Evidence for Association of Acupuncture and Acupressure With Improved Cancer Pain: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *JAMA Oncol*, 2020. 6(2): p. 271-278.
11. Hou, S., et al., Treatment of Chemotherapy-Induced Peripheral Neuropathy: Systematic Review and Recommendations. *Pain Physician*, 2018. 21(6): p. 571-592.
12. Huang, J.F., et al., Can Acupuncture Improve Chronic Spinal Pain? A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Global Spine J*, 2020: p. 2192568220962440.
13. Jo, J., Y.J. Lee, and H. Lee, Acupuncture for polycystic ovarian syndrome: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Medicine (Baltimore)*, 2017. 96(23): p. e7066.
14. Kizhakkeveetil, A., K. Rose, and G.E. Kadar, Integrative therapies for low back pain that include complementary and alternative medicine care: a systematic review. *Glob Adv Health Med*, 2014. 3(5): p. 49-64.
15. Kolber, M.R., et al., PEER systematic review of randomized controlled trials: Management of chronic low back pain in primary care. *Can Fam Physician*, 2021. 67(1): p. e20-e30.
16. Lan, L., et al., Acupuncture for functional dyspepsia. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2014(10): p. Cd008487.
17. Li, C., et al., The response-time relationship and covariate effects of acupuncture for chronic pain: A systematic review and model-based longitudinal meta-analysis. *Eur J Pain*, 2020. 24(9): p. 1653-1665.

18. Metcalf, O., et al., Efficacy of Fifteen Emerging Interventions for the Treatment of Posttraumatic Stress Disorder: A Systematic Review. *J Trauma Stress*, 2016. 29(1): p. 88-92.
19. Mu, J., et al., Acupuncture for chronic nonspecific low back pain. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2020. 12: p. Cd013814.
20. Mulla, S.M., et al., Management of Central Poststroke Pain: Systematic Review of Randomized Controlled Trials. *Stroke*, 2015. 46(10): p. 2853-60.
21. Nascimento, P., et al., Effectiveness of interventions for non-specific low back pain in older adults. A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Physiotherapy*, 2019. 105(2): p. 147-162.
22. Seo, S.Y., et al., Effectiveness of Acupuncture and Electroacupuncture for Chronic Neck Pain: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Am J Chin Med*, 2017. 45(8): p. 1573-1595.
23. Smith, C.A., et al., Acupuncture or acupressure for pain management during labour. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2020. 2(2): p. Cd009232.
24. Tang, H., et al., Acupuncture for Lateral Epicondylitis: A Systematic Review. *Evid Based Complement Alternat Med*, 2015. 2015: p. 861849.
25. Trinh, K., et al., Acupuncture for neck disorders. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2016(5): p. Cd004870.
26. Wahbeh, H., et al., Complementary and Alternative Medicine for Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms: A Systematic Review. *J Evid Based Complementary Altern Med*, 2014. 19(3): p. 161-175.
27. Wu, J., D. Chen, and N. Liu, Effectiveness of acupuncture in polycystic ovary syndrome: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Medicine (Baltimore)*, 2020. 99(22): p. e20441.
28. Xiang, Y., et al., Evidence of efficacy of acupuncture in the management of low back pain: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised placebo- or sham-controlled trials. *Acupunct Med*, 2020. 38(1): p. 15-24.
29. Xie, Z.Y., et al., The effects of acupuncture on pregnancy outcomes of in vitro fertilization: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMC Complement Altern Med*, 2019. 19(1): p. 131.
30. Yu, C., et al., Effectiveness of acupuncture for angina pectoris: a systematic review of randomized controlled trials. *BMC Complement Altern Med*, 2015. 15: p. 90.
31. Yuan, Q.L., et al., Traditional Chinese medicine for neck pain and low back pain: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *PLoS One*, 2015. 10(2): p. e0117146.
32. Zhong, Y., et al., Acupuncture in improving endometrial receptivity: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMC Complement Altern Med*, 2019. 19(1): p. 61.
33. Zhou, Y., et al., Effectiveness of Acupuncture for Lateral Epicondylitis: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of Randomized Controlled Trials. *Pain Res Manag*, 2020. 2020: p. 8506591.

APPENDIX C. EXCLUDED PUBLICATIONS

Not Reviewed in Detail in Favor of a Better SR on Same Topic, $N = 33$

1. Amaral, L.K.B., et al., Efficacy of conservative therapy in older people with nonspecific low back pain: A systematic review with meta-analysis and GRADE recommendations. *Arch Gerontol Geriatr*, 2020. 90: p. 104177.
2. Asher, G.N., et al., Comparative Benefits and Harms of Complementary and Alternative Medicine Therapies for Initial Treatment of Major Depressive Disorder: Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *J Altern Complement Med*, 2017. 23(12): p. 907-919.
3. Bisson, J.I., et al., Non-pharmacological and non-psychological approaches to the treatment of PTSD: results of a systematic review and meta-analyses. *Eur J Psychotraumatol*, 2020. 11(1): p. 1795361.
4. Cheong, Y.C., et al., Acupuncture and assisted reproductive technology. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2013(7): p. Cd006920.
5. Close, C., et al., A systematic review investigating the effectiveness of Complementary and Alternative Medicine (CAM) for the management of low back and/or pelvic pain (LBPP) in pregnancy. *J Adv Nurs*, 2014. 70(8): p. 1702-16.
6. Dai, L., et al., Acupuncture and Derived Therapies for Pain in Palliative Cancer Management: Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis Based on Single-Arm and Controlled Trials. *J Palliat Med*, 2021.
7. Deare, J.C., et al., Acupuncture for treating fibromyalgia. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2013. 2013(5): p. Cd007070.
8. Gao, R., et al., Acupuncture and clomiphene citrate for anovulatory infertility: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Acupunct Med*, 2020. 38(1): p. 25-36.
9. Gutke, A., et al., Treatments for pregnancy-related lumbopelvic pain: a systematic review of physiotherapy modalities. *Acta Obstet Gynecol Scand*, 2015. 94(11): p. 1156-67.
10. He, Y., et al., Clinical Evidence for Association of Acupuncture and Acupressure With Improved Cancer Pain: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *JAMA Oncol*, 2020. 6(2): p. 271-278.
11. Hou, S., et al., Treatment of Chemotherapy-Induced Peripheral Neuropathy: Systematic Review and Recommendations. *Pain Physician*, 2018. 21(6): p. 571-592.
12. Huang, J.F., et al., Can Acupuncture Improve Chronic Spinal Pain? A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Global Spine J*, 2020: p. 2192568220962440.
13. Jo, J., Y.J. Lee, and H. Lee, Acupuncture for polycystic ovarian syndrome: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Medicine (Baltimore)*, 2017. 96(23): p. e7066.
14. Kizhakkeveetil, A., K. Rose, and G.E. Kadar, Integrative therapies for low back pain that include complementary and alternative medicine care: a systematic review. *Glob Adv Health Med*, 2014. 3(5): p. 49-64.
15. Kolber, M.R., et al., PEER systematic review of randomized controlled trials: Management of chronic low back pain in primary care. *Can Fam Physician*, 2021. 67(1): p. e20-e30.
16. Lan, L., et al., Acupuncture for functional dyspepsia. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2014(10): p. Cd008487.
17. Li, C., et al., The response-time relationship and covariate effects of acupuncture for chronic pain: A systematic review and model-based longitudinal meta-analysis. *Eur J Pain*, 2020. 24(9): p. 1653-1665.

18. Metcalf, O., et al., Efficacy of Fifteen Emerging Interventions for the Treatment of Posttraumatic Stress Disorder: A Systematic Review. *J Trauma Stress*, 2016. 29(1): p. 88-92.
19. Mu, J., et al., Acupuncture for chronic nonspecific low back pain. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2020. 12: p. Cd013814.
20. Mulla, S.M., et al., Management of Central Poststroke Pain: Systematic Review of Randomized Controlled Trials. *Stroke*, 2015. 46(10): p. 2853-60.
21. Nascimento, P., et al., Effectiveness of interventions for non-specific low back pain in older adults. A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Physiotherapy*, 2019. 105(2): p. 147-162.
22. Seo, S.Y., et al., Effectiveness of Acupuncture and Electroacupuncture for Chronic Neck Pain: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *Am J Chin Med*, 2017. 45(8): p. 1573-1595.
23. Smith, C.A., et al., Acupuncture or acupressure for pain management during labour. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2020. 2(2): p. Cd009232.
24. Tang, H., et al., Acupuncture for Lateral Epicondylitis: A Systematic Review. *Evid Based Complement Alternat Med*, 2015. 2015: p. 861849.
25. Trinh, K., et al., Acupuncture for neck disorders. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2016(5): p. Cd004870.
26. Wahbeh, H., et al., Complementary and Alternative Medicine for Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms: A Systematic Review. *J Evid Based Complementary Altern Med*, 2014. 19(3): p. 161-175.
27. Wu, J., D. Chen, and N. Liu, Effectiveness of acupuncture in polycystic ovary syndrome: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *Medicine (Baltimore)*, 2020. 99(22): p. e20441.
28. Xiang, Y., et al., Evidence of efficacy of acupuncture in the management of low back pain: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised placebo- or sham-controlled trials. *Acupunct Med*, 2020. 38(1): p. 15-24.
29. Xie, Z.Y., et al., The effects of acupuncture on pregnancy outcomes of in vitro fertilization: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMC Complement Altern Med*, 2019. 19(1): p. 131.
30. Yu, C., et al., Effectiveness of acupuncture for angina pectoris: a systematic review of randomized controlled trials. *BMC Complement Altern Med*, 2015. 15: p. 90.
31. Yuan, Q.L., et al., Traditional Chinese medicine for neck pain and low back pain: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *PLoS One*, 2015. 10(2): p. e0117146.
32. Zhong, Y., et al., Acupuncture in improving endometrial receptivity: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMC Complement Altern Med*, 2019. 19(1): p. 61.
33. Zhou, Y., et al., Effectiveness of Acupuncture for Lateral Epicondylitis: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of Randomized Controlled Trials. *Pain Res Manag*, 2020. 2020: p. 8506591.

Duplicate, N = 3

1. Franco, J.V., et al., *Non-pharmacological interventions for treating chronic prostatitis/chronic pelvic pain syndrome*. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2018. 5(5): p. Cd012551.
2. Pennick, V. and S.D. Liddle, *Interventions for preventing and treating pelvic and back pain in pregnancy*. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2013(8): p. Cd001139.
3. Zimpel, S.A., et al., *Complementary and alternative therapies for post-caesarean pain*. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, 2020(9).

Review of Reviews, $N = 2$

1. Huang, J., et al., *Acupuncture for the Treatment of Alzheimer's Disease: An Overview of Systematic Reviews*. *Front Aging Neurosci*, 2020. **12**: p. 574023.
2. Wang, L.Y., et al., *Overview of Meta-Analyses of Five Non-pharmacological Interventions for Alzheimer's Disease*. *Front Aging Neurosci*, 2020. **12**: p. 594432.

No Outcome of Interest, $N = 1$

1. Wong, V., et al., *Acupuncture for acute management and rehabilitation of traumatic brain injury*. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*, 2013(3): p. Cd007700.

Not an Intervention of Interest, $N = 1$

1. Lan, Y., et al., *Auricular acupuncture with seed or pellet attachments for primary insomnia: a systematic review and meta-analysis*. *BMC Complement Altern Med*, 2015. **15**: p. 103.

Comparison, $N = 1$

1. Mo, Z., et al., *Comparisons of the Effectiveness and Safety of Tuina, Acupuncture, Traction, and Chinese Herbs for Lumbar Disc Herniation: A Systematic Review and Network Meta-Analysis*. *Evid Based Complement Alternat Med*, 2019. **2019**: p. 6821310.

APPENDIX D. CONDITIONS AND SUB-CONDITIONS OF INCLUDED SYSTEMATIC REVIEWS

| Condition | Sub-Condition | Map |
|--|--|----------------------|
| Angina ⁶⁴ | None | Other |
| Ankle Sprain/Pain ³⁹ | None | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Anxiety | Pre-operative Anxiety ⁴⁴ | Mental Health |
| Back Pain | Chronic Low Back Pain ²⁰ | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Back Pain | Low Back Pain - Herniated Disc ⁴⁰ | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Back Pain | Chronic Low Back Pain (Radicular Back Pain) ¹⁰ | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Back Pain | Acute Low Back Pain ¹⁰ | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Cancer-related Pain | Hormone Therapy-related Side Effects in Breast Cancer Patients ²² | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Cancer-related Pain | Chemotherapy-induced Peripheral Neuropathy ²³ | Pain |
| Cancer-related Pain | Health-related Quality of Life in Cancer Patients ⁶⁵ | Other |
| Cancer-related Pain | Pain Management in Cancer ²⁴ | Pain |
| Carpal Tunnel Syndrome ¹⁷ | None | Pain |
| Chronic Fatigue Syndrome ⁶⁶ | None | Other |
| Chronic Fatigue Syndrome ¹¹ | None | Other |
| Chronic Musculoskeletal Pain ¹⁶ | None | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Depression | Post-stroke Depression ⁴⁵ | Mental Health |
| Depression | Depression in Pregnancy ⁴⁶ | Mental Health |
| Depression ⁴⁷ | None | Mental Health |
| Depression | Major Depressive Disorder ⁴⁸ | Mental Health |
| Diabetic Peripheral Neuropathy ²⁵ | None | Pain |
| Dysmenorrhea ⁵⁶ | None | Women's Health |
| Dyspepsia | Functional Dyspepsia ⁶⁷ | Other |
| Fertility | Assistive Reproductive Therapy ⁵⁷ | Women's Health |
| Fertility | Anovulatory Infertility ⁵⁸ | Women's Health |
| Fertility | Oocyte Retrieval ⁵⁹ | Women's Health |
| Fertility | Polycystic Ovary Syndrome / Ovarian Hyperstimulation ⁶⁰ | Women's Health |
| Fibromyalgia | Pain, Fatigue, Sleep Quality ²⁶ | Pain |
| Fibromyalgia | None | Pain |
| Headache | Migraine, Active Therapy ²⁸ | Pain |
| Headache | Occipital Neuralgia ²⁹ | Pain |
| Headache | Migraine Headache Without Aura ³⁰ | Pain |

| Condition | Sub-Condition | Map |
|--|---|----------------------|
| Headache | Migraine, Mixed Comparators ³¹ | Pain |
| Headache | Tension-type Headache ³² | Pain |
| Herpes Zoster ⁶⁸ | None | Other |
| Inflammatory Bowel Disease ⁶⁹ | None | Other |
| Irritable Bowel Syndrome ⁷⁰ | None | Other |
| Insomnia | Insomnia in Elderly ⁴⁹ | Mental Health |
| Insomnia | Primary Insomnia ⁵⁰ | Mental Health |
| Lateral Elbow Pain ¹⁴ | None | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Menopause ⁶¹ | None | Women's Health |
| Mixed Pain - Not Specified | Painful Conditions in Emergency Department ¹³ | Other |
| Mixed Pain - Not Specified | Immediate Pain Relief in Musculoskeletal Pain Conditions ⁴¹ | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Mixed Pain - Not Specified | Post-stroke Shoulder-hand Syndrome ¹² | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Neck Pain | Chronic Neck Pain ²⁰ | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Osteoarthritis | Knee Pain ²⁰ | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Osteoarthritis | Hip Pain ⁴² | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Other Acute Pain | Post-operative Pain ¹⁹ | Pain |
| Other Acute Pain | Dental Pain ¹⁹ | Pain |
| Other Acute Pain | Kidney Stone ¹⁹ | Pain |
| Other Chronic Pain - Various | Chronic Non-cancer Pain ¹⁸ | Pain |
| Other Specific Pain | Acupuncture for Improving Cognitive Impairment After Stroke ⁷¹ | Other |
| Peripheral Neuropathy ³³ | None | Pain |
| Premenstrual Syndrome ⁶² | None | Women's Health |
| Post-herpetic Neuralgia ³⁴ | None | Pain |
| Post-operative Pain | Post-caesarean Pain ³⁵ | Women's Health |
| Post-operative Pain | Post-operative Pain, Active Therapy ³⁶ | Pain |
| Post-operative Pain | Post-operative Pain, Mixed Comparators ³⁷ | Pain |
| Pregnancy | Low Back and Pelvic Pain ⁶³ | Women's Health |
| Primary Ovarian Insufficiency | Resumption of Menses ⁵⁵ | Women's Health |
| Primary Trigeminal Neuralgia ³⁸ | None | Pain |
| Prostatitis - Chronic Pelvic Pain | Chronic Prostatitis/Chronic Pelvic Pain Syndrome ⁹ | Pain |

| Condition | Sub-Condition | Map |
|---|------------------------------------|----------------------|
| Posttraumatic Stress Syndrome ⁵¹ | None | Mental Health |
| Schizophrenia ⁵² | None | Mental Health |
| Shoulder Pain | Frozen Shoulder ⁴³ | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Shoulder Pain | None ²¹ | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Substance Use Disorder | Opioid Use Disorder ⁵³ | Mental Health |
| Substance Use Disorder | Tobacco Use Disorder ⁵⁴ | Mental Health |
| Temporomandibular Pain ²¹ | None | Musculoskeletal Pain |
| Tinnitus ¹⁵ | None | Other |

APPENDIX E. CONCLUSIONS FROM SYSTEMATIC REVIEWS INCLUDED IN THE EVIDENCE MAP

Angina

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------|---------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Yang, 2019 ⁶⁴ | None | Compared with sham acupuncture, acupuncture may be associated with improving average pain intensity, 6-Min Walk Test, anxiety symptoms, and depression symptoms. | Very Low to Moderate | 17 |

Ankle Pain

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|-------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Kim, 2014 ³⁹ | None | We are unable to conclude whether acupuncture is more effective than other standard methods for the treatment of ankle sprains in adults because of the very low quality of the available evidence. Because the adverse effects of acupuncture treatment were not described in most of the studies, we are also unable to draw any conclusions about the safety of acupuncture. | Very Low | 19 |

Anxiety

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------|-----------------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Tong, 2021 ⁴⁴ | Pre-Operative Anxiety | Acupuncture therapy, compared with sham therapy, significantly reduced the STAI-S score for patients with preoperative anxiety. | Very Low to Moderate | 5 |

Back Pain

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|----------------------------|---|--|-----------------------|--|
| Chou, 2017 ¹⁰ | Chronic Low Back Pain (Radicular Back Pain) | Acupuncture vs sham acupuncture: moderate magnitude of effect for pain; no effect for function Acupuncture vs no acupuncture: moderate magnitude of effect for pain; moderate for function | Low | 9 |
| Chou, 2017 ¹⁰ | Acute Low Back Pain | Acupuncture vs sham small magnitude of effect for pain; no effect for function | Low | 9 |
| Skelly, 2020 ²⁰ | Chronic Low Back Pain | Acupuncture was associated with a small improvement in short-term function compared with sham acupuncture or usual care; there was no difference between acupuncture and controls in intermediate-term or long-term function. Acupuncture was associated with small improvements in short-term and long-term pain compared with sham acupuncture, usual care, an attention control, or a placebo intervention, but there was no difference in intermediate-term pain. | Low | 8 |
| Tang, 2018 ⁴⁰ | Low Back Pain - Herniated Disc | Acupuncture was better than traction and diclofenac sodium at improvements in VAS pain. | Very Low | 30 |

Cancer-related Pain

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|---|---|-----------------------|--|
| Hu, 2016 ²⁴ | Pain Management in Cancer | Acupuncture plus drug therapy is more effective than conventional drug therapy alone, but acupuncture alone is not more effective than conventional drug therapy. Acupuncture is not more effective than sham acupuncture. | Very Low | 20 |
| Hwang, 2020 ²³ | Chemotherapy-induced Peripheral Neuropathy | Acupuncture was more effective than pharmacological treatment. | Low | 5 |
| Lin, 2019 ⁶⁵ | Health-related Quality of Life in Cancer Patients | Acupuncture has no effect on health-related quality of life. | Low | 4 |

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|------------------------------|--|---|-----------------------|--|
| Yuanqing, 2020 ²² | Hormone Therapy-Related Side Effects in Breast Cancer Patients | Acupuncture is a moderately appropriate alternative therapy for hormone therapy-related side effects in breast cancer patients. | Low | 20 |

Carpal Tunnel Syndrome

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------|---------------|---|---|--|
| Choi, 2018 ¹⁷ | None | No clear difference in acupuncture vs sham- short term follow-up: 8 weeks / 3 months No clear difference in clinical improvement between acupuncture vs oral corticosteroid-short term follow-up: 4 weeks / 13 months Better clinical improvement with acupuncture vs corticosteroids in long-term follow-up: 7 months / 13 months No clear difference in rates of improvement in acupuncture vs vitamin B12 - short term follow-up No clear difference in rates of improvement in electro-acupuncture vs night splints - short term follow-up There was more clinical improvement in acupuncture vs ibuprofen-short term follow-up: 4 weeks | Very Low to Low Very Low Very Low Very Low Very Low Very Low | 10 |

Chronic Fatigue Syndrome

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|---------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Wang, 2014 ¹¹ | None | There were significant better effects in acupuncture group compared with sham as measured by the Chalder’s Fatigue Scale (physical) score. | Low to Moderate | 7 |
| Zhang, 2019 ⁶⁶ | None | In summary, acupuncture appears more effective than sham acupuncture and Chinese herbal medicine for the treatment of CFS. | Very Low to Low | 13 |

Chronic Musculoskeletal Pain



| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|-----------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Vickers, 2018 ¹⁶ | None | Acupuncture is effective for the treatment of chronic pain compared with sham and control, with treatment effects persisting over time. | Moderate | 39 |

Depression

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|-----------------------------|---------------------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Liu, 2021 ⁴⁵ | Post-stroke Depression | Acupuncture combined with conventional treatment could significantly reduce post-stroke depression. Acupuncture was safer than anti-depressants. | Very Low to Low | 17 |
| Smith, 2018 ⁴⁷ | None | The reduction in severity of depression was less when acupuncture was compared with control acupuncture than when acupuncture was compared with no treatment control. The reduction in severity of depression with acupuncture given alone or in conjunction with medication versus medication alone is uncertain. The effect of acupuncture compared with psychological therapy is unclear. Acupuncture did however have a positive effect on physical quality of life at the end of treatment when compared with sham acupuncture. | Very Low to Low | 64 |
| Smith, 2019 ⁴⁶ | Depression in Pregnancy | Acupuncture compared to control may reduce antenatal depression. | Moderate | 2 |
| Sorbero, 2016 ⁴⁸ | Major Depressive Disorder | Acupuncture may be superior to waitlist; limited evidence suggests a higher rate of responders with adjunctive acupuncture plus anti-depressants compared with anti-depressants alone. | Low | 18 |

Dysmenorrhea

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Smith, 2016 ⁵⁶ | None | There is insufficient evidence to demonstrate whether acupuncture is effective in treating primary dysmenorrhea, and for most comparisons no data were available on adverse events. | Very Low to Low | 32 |

Fertility

| Author, Year | Sub condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|--|---|-----------------------|--|
| Coyle, 2021 ⁵⁷ | Assistive Reproductive Therapy | When compared with sham acupuncture, acupuncture performed at the time of embryo transfer does not result in better outcomes for live birth rate or for miscarriage rate. | High | 6 |
| Jo, 2017 ⁶⁰ | Polycystic Ovary Syndrome / Ovarian Hyperstimulation | Acupuncture may increase the clinical pregnancy rate and ongoing pregnancy rate and decrease the risk of Ovarian Hyperstimulation Syndrome in women with Polycystic Ovarian Syndrome undergoing in vitro fertilization or intracytoplasmic sperm injection. | Low | 4 |
| Kwan, 2018 ⁵⁹ | Oocyte Retrieval | Compared to conscious sedation alone, more effective pain relief during oocyte retrieval was reported when conscious sedation was combined with electro-acupuncture. No significant increase in pregnancy rate. | Low | 7 |
| Lim, 2019 ⁵⁸ | Anovulatory Infertility | There was no evidence of any clinically relevant differences in live birth rate, multiple pregnancy rate, ovulation rate, clinical pregnancy rate, and miscarriage rate in sham vs acupuncture. We were uncertain whether acupuncture improved ovulation rate compared to active treatment. | Low Very Low | 8 |

Fibromyalgia

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|------------------------------|--|------------------------------|---|
| Kim, 2019 ²⁶ | Pain, Fatigue, Sleep Quality | Verum acupuncture is more effective than sham acupuncture for pain relief, improving sleep quality, and improving general status in fibromyalgia syndrome posttreatment. | Moderate to High | 10 |
| Zhang, 2019 ²⁷ | None | Compared with sham, real acupuncture was more effective in reducing pain and improving quality of life after treatment in the short term. At follow-up in the long term, the effect of acupuncture was also superior to that of sham acupuncture. | Low to Moderate Low | 12 |

Functional Dyspepsia

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------|----------------------|---|------------------------------|---|
| Pang, 2016 ⁶⁷ | None | Acupuncture therapy has a similar effect for functional dyspepsia in comparison with sham acupuncture. Acupuncture therapy is superior to medication (prokinetic agents) in improving the symptoms and quality of life of functional dyspepsia patients. | Low Low | 16 |

Headache

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|---|----------------------------------|--|
| Giovanardi, 2020 ²⁸ | Migraine | Acupuncture is mildly more effective and much safer than medication for the prophylaxis of migraine. | Moderate | 9 |
| Linde, 2016 ³² | Tension-type Headache | Acupuncture reduces headache frequency over usual care and sham. | Moderate | 12 |
| Linde, 2016 ³¹ | Migraine | Compared with no acupuncture, acupuncture was associated with a moderate reduction of headache frequency over no acupuncture after treatment. Comparison with sham, both after treatment and at follow-up, acupuncture was associated with a small but statistically significant frequency reduction over sham. Compared with prophylactic drug treatment, acupuncture reduced migraine frequency significantly more than drug prophylaxis after treatment. | Moderate Moderate Moderate | 22 |
| Xu, 2018 ³⁰ | Migraine Headache without Aura | Acupuncture had a significant advantage over medication in reducing frequency of migraine, pain score, and effective rate. Acupuncture also had a significant advantage over sham acupuncture in reducing frequency of migraine and pain score. | Very Low to Low | 14 |
| Yun, 2020 ²⁹ | Occipital Neuralgia | Acupuncture was more effective than medication at reducing VAS pain. Acupuncture was more effective than medication on the total effective rate. | Very Low Low | 11 |

Herpes Zoster

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|-------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Cui, 2021 ⁶⁸ | None | When compared with antiviral therapy, acupuncture was associated with a significant reduction in pain, a significant reduction in incrustation time, and a significant reduction in decrustation time. Compared with active treatment, acupuncture was associated with reduction on the overall incidence of post-herpetic neuralgia | Low Moderate | 21 |



Inflammatory Bowel Disease

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Wang, 2020 ⁶⁹ | None | Acupuncture may be more effective in treating ulcerative colitis compared to conventional medicine (metronidazole combined with sulfasalazine). | Low to Moderate | 13 |

Insomnia

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------|---------------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Cao, 2019 ⁵⁰ | Primary Insomnia | Acupuncture might result in improvement compared to no treatment on Pittsburgh Sleep Quality Index scores and appears safe. | Very Low to Low | 73 |
| Kwon, 2020 ⁴⁹ | Insomnia in Elderly | Using Pittsburgh Sleep Quality Index score, acupuncture and acupuncture combined with relaxation were both more effective in improving sleep quality compared to relaxation alone. | Very Low to Moderate | 13 |

Irritable Bowel Syndrome

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|-------------------------|---------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Guo, 2020 ⁷⁰ | None | Compared with loperamide, acupuncture showed more effectiveness in weekly defecation. Compared to dicetel, acupuncture produced more significant effect related to the total symptom score and IBS Symptom Severity Scale. | Low to Moderate | 31 |

Lateral Elbow Pain

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|-------------------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Navarro-Santana, 2020 ¹⁴ | None | Evidence suggests positive effects of acupuncture, but not electro-acupuncture, for pain, related disability, and strength, in lateral epicondylalgia of musculoskeletal origin, in the short term. | Very Low to Low | 14 |

Menopause

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Dodin, 2013 ⁶¹ | None | When acupuncture was compared with sham acupuncture, there was no evidence of any difference in their effect on hot flushes. When acupuncture was compared with no treatment, there appeared to be a benefit from acupuncture, but acupuncture appeared to be less effective than HT. | Very Low to Low | 16 |

Mixed Not Specified Pain

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|--|---|-----------------------|--|
| Chia, 2018 ¹³ | Painful Conditions in Emergency Department | Acupuncture was superior with sham acupuncture, more effective than intravenous morphine, comparable to conventional Emergency Department treatment, and superior to standard Emergency Department care alone when used on an adjuvant basis. | Low | 6 |
| Liu, 2019 ¹² | Post-stroke Shoulder-Hand Syndrome | Acupuncture therapy seems effective for motor function, pain relief, and activities of daily living in stroke patients with mild Shoulder-hand Syndrome, when it is used in combination with rehabilitation. | Low | 38 |
| Xiang, 2017 ⁴¹ | Immediate Pain Relief in Musculoskeletal Pain Conditions | Acupuncture was associated with a greater immediate pain relief effect compared with sham acupuncture. Acupuncture was associated with greater immediate pain relief effect when compared to analgesic injections. | Moderate Low | 13 |

Neck Pain

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|----------------------------|-------------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Skelly, 2020 ²⁰ | Chronic Neck Pain | Acupuncture was associated with small improvements in short-term and intermediate-term function versus sham acupuncture, a placebo (sham laser), or usual care. | Low | 11 |
| | | There were no differences in pain in trials comparing acupuncture with sham acupuncture or placebo interventions in the short term. | Low | |
| | | There was insufficient evidence to draw conclusions regarding short-term function or pain for acupuncture versus NSAIDs. | Low | |
| | | No serious adverse events were reported in 6 trials reporting harms. | Low | |

Osteoarthritis

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|-------------------------------|---------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Manheimer, 2018 ⁴² | Hip Pain | Acupuncture probably has little or no effect in reducing pain or improving function relative to sham acupuncture in people with hip osteoarthritis. | Moderate | 6 |
| Skelly, 2020 ²⁰ | Knee Pain | There were no differences between acupuncture versus control interventions (sham acupuncture, waitlist, or usual care) on function in the intermediate term | Low | 9 |
| | | There were no clinically meaningful differences between acupuncture versus control interventions (sham acupuncture, waitlist, or usual care) on pain in the intermediate term. | Moderate | |

Other Acute Pain

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------|----------------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Chou, 2020 ¹⁹ | Post-operative Pain | There is inconsistent evidence on acupuncture's effect on pain intensity when compared with sham. Acupuncture may be associated with decrease analgesic use after 1 day compared to usual care. | Very Low | 2 |
| Chou, 2020 ¹⁹ | Dental Surgical Pain | There is insufficient evidence of acupuncture's effect on post-operative pain compared with sham acupuncture. | Very Low | 1 |
| Chou, 2020 ¹⁹ | Kidney Stone | Acupuncture was not effective in reducing pain intensity vs medication for kidney stone. | Low | 1 |

Other Chronic Pain - Various

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|-------------------------------|-------------------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Eccleston, 2017 ¹⁸ | Chronic Non-cancer Pain | There is no evidence for the efficacy or safety of electro-acupuncture for reducing prescribed opioid use in chronic pain. | Very Low | 1 |

Other Specific

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------|--|--|-----------------------|--|
| Zhou, 2020 ⁷¹ | Improvement of Cognitive Impairment After Stroke | Acupuncture was effective in improving PSCI (post-stroke cognitive impairment) compared to no treatment or sham. | Moderate | 37 |

Pelvic Pain

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|---|--|--------------------------|--|
| Franco, 2019 ⁹ | Chronic Prostatitis/ Chronic Pelvic Pain Syndrome | Acupuncture probably reduced prostatitis symptoms (compared with sham). Acupuncture may have reduced prostatitis symptoms compared with medical treatment | Moderate Moderate | 6 |

Peripheral Neuropathy

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|------------------------|---------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Ju, 2017 ³³ | None | There is insufficient evidence to support or refute the use of acupuncture for neuropathic pain in general or for any specific neuropathic pain condition when compared with sham acupuncture or other active therapies. | Very Low to Low | 6 |

Peripheral Neuropathy (Diabetic)

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Amato, 2019 ²⁵ | None | Evidence for acupuncture was insufficient for diabetic peripheral neuropathy. | Very Low | 1 |

Post-herpetic Neuralgia

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|-------------------------|---------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Pei, 2019 ³⁴ | None | Acupuncture was more effective in reducing post-herpetic neuralgia pain intensity compared to control. | Low to Moderate | 4 |

Post-operative Pain

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|-----------------------------|---------------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Tedesco, 2017 ³⁷ | None | Acupuncture reduced or delayed opioid consumption compared with sham or no treatment. | Low to Moderate | 4 |
| Yin, 2020 ³⁶ | None | Compared to active treatment, acupuncture may improve the overall symptoms of Postcholecystectomy syndrome (PCS). | Low to Moderate | 14 |
| Zimpel, 2020 ³⁵ | Post-caesarean Pain | We are very uncertain if acupuncture (versus no treatment) or acupuncture plus analgesia (versus placebo plus analgesia) has any effect on pain because the quality of evidence is very low. Acupuncture plus analgesia (versus analgesia) may reduce pain at 12 hours and 24 hours. | Very Low | 4 |

Posttraumatic Stress Disorder

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Grant, 2018 ⁵¹ | None | Needle acupuncture reduces PTSD and depressive symptoms at follow-up compared to passive controls, treatment-as-usual, and active interventions. No significant differences were observed between acupuncture and comparators for other outcomes. | Very Low to Low | 7 |

Pregnancy

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|----------------------------|--------------------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Liddle, 2015 ⁶³ | Low Back and Pelvic Pain | There was evidence from single studies that acupuncture significantly improves evening pelvic pain better than stabilizing exercise or usual prenatal care. There is evidence suggesting that acupuncture is better than physiotherapy at relieving evening low back and pelvic pain and related functional disability, and improves pain, but not women's ability to carry out daily activities, when started at 26- rather than 20-weeks' gestation. | Moderate Low | 4 |

Premenstrual Syndrome

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|----------------------------|---------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Armour, 2018 ⁶² | None | Acupuncture may reduce overall mood and physical PMS symptoms when compared with sham. There was not enough evidence to determine the safety of acupuncture. | Low | 4 |

Primary Ovarian Insufficiency

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|------------------------|----------------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Jo, 2015 ⁵⁵ | Resumption of Menses | Acupuncture was better than comparison treatments in the resumption of menses. There are insufficient data to reach conclusions about the effect of acupuncture on symptoms. | Low Very Low | 6 |

Primary Trigeminal Neuralgia

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|------------------------|---------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Hu, 2019 ³⁸ | None | Acupuncture might have some positive effects for primary trigeminal neuralgia. | Very Low to Low | 33 |

Schizophrenia

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Shen, 2014 ⁵² | None | Limited evidence suggests that acupuncture may have some antipsychotic effects as measured on global and mental state with few adverse effects. | Very Low to Low | 30 |

Shoulder Pain

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|------------------------------|-----------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Yuan, 2016 ²¹ | None | Acupuncture is superior to sham acupuncture in relief of pain. | High | 5 |
| Ben-Arie, 2020 ⁴³ | Frozen Shoulder | Acupuncture could be safe and effective for pain reduction, restoring shoulder function, and restoring flexion ROM for frozen shoulder patients in the short term and midterm. | Very Low | 13 |

Substance Use Disorder

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|---------------------------|----------------------|--|---------------------------------|--|
| Chen, 2018 ⁵³ | Opioid Use Disorder | Acupuncture may be effective for alleviating some symptoms compared with sham and no treatment. There was insufficient evidence to suggest better effect of acupuncture compared with medication. | Very Low to Low Moderate | 9 |
| White, 2014 ⁵⁴ | Tobacco Use Disorder | Compared with sham, acupuncture resulted in greater short-term smoking cessation. | Moderate | 19 |

Temporomandibular Joint Dysfunction

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|--------------------------|---------------|---|-----------------------|--|
| Yuan, 2016 ²¹ | None | Real acupuncture showed a favorable effect on pain relief compared with sham. | Moderate | 13 |

Tinnitus

| Author, Year | Sub-condition | Conclusion | Certainty of Evidence | Total Number of Studies Included for Acupuncture |
|----------------------------|---------------|--|-----------------------|--|
| Savage, 2014 ¹⁵ | None | Unclear if acupuncture is effective in people with tinnitus. | Low | 1 |

APPENDIX F. PEER REVIEW DISPOSITION

| Comment # | Reviewer # | Comment | Author Response |
|--|------------|--|---|
| <i>Are the objectives, scope, and methods for this review clearly described?</i> | | | |
| 1 | 1 | Yes | Thank you. |
| 2 | 3 | Yes | Thank you. |
| 3 | 4 | Yes | Thank you. |
| 4 | 5 | Yes | Thank you. |
| <i>Is there any indication of bias in our synthesis of the evidence?</i> | | | |
| 5 | 1 | No | Thank you. |
| 6 | 3 | No | Thank you. |
| 7 | 4 | No | Thank you. |
| 8 | 5 | No | Thank you. |
| <i>Are there any published or unpublished studies that we may have overlooked?</i> | | | |
| 9 | 1 | Yes - These two meta-analyses by the Acupuncture Trialists Collaboration (over 20,000 individual patients) have been very influential in many of the guidelines that have been established for acupuncture and pain--but I do not see them included. I understand that especially the updated version may not have met your criteria for inclusion because it did not include a systematic review per se. But I wonder if there is some way to add a mention of this work to the discussion given its importance in the evolution of the field. One of the important things about this work is that they had enough individual patients to analyze separately the studies that compared to sham and those that compared to usual care--demonstrating much larger difference in effects when no sham comparison was included. Since sham acupuncture has an effect generally larger than most placebo controls, the use of this methodology in the past may have contributed to an underestimate of the true effect of real acupuncture, which is what is relevant to clinicians and patients. You mention in the conclusion that more studies are needed comparing | This is a really excellent point. The original Vickers review was included in the prior version of this evidence map. But the updated Vickers review was not included in this map because the updated Vickers review did not assess certainty of evidence, which was a criterion for inclusion. But, since the Vickers review was an individual patient data meta-analysis, which is an inherently stronger type of review than a conventional review, we were essentially penalizing it for being good. Fortunately, in the Vickers review they also presented the results of their data as a conventional meta-analysis, and thus we were able to apply the GRADE criteria to come up with a certainty of evidence rating for their conclusion – and thus we are able to get it onto the map. |

| Comment # | Reviewer # | Comment | Author Response |
|--|------------|--|--|
| | | <p>to conditions other than sham--but you do not really address the impact that sham as the dominant comparison in the past may have had on the ultimate conclusions of the systematic reviewers.</p> <p>Vickers AJ, Cronin AM, Maschino AC, et al. Acupuncture for Chronic Pain: Individual Patient Data Meta-analysis. Arch Intern Med. 2012;172(19):1444–1453. doi:10.1001/archinternmed.2012.3654</p> <p>Vickers AJ, Vertosick EA, Lewith G, et al.; Acupuncture Trialists' Collaboration. Acupuncture for chronic pain: update of an individual patient data meta-analysis. J Pain. 2018;19(5):455–474.</p> <p>If you'd like I could write you few lines on this to include in the Discussion--and could cite the Vickers work there perhaps :)</p> | |
| 10 | 3 | No | |
| 11 | 4 | No | |
| 12 | 5 | No | |
| <i>Additional suggestions or comments can be provided below.</i> | | | |
| 13 | 1 | See above | Thank you for your comment! |
| 14 | 3 | Page 6- paragraph "Purpose" Would be appreciated if there was an added sentence designating that this publication is not intended to reflect established policy recommendations for clinical practice more explicitly. | Thank you for your comment. This is addressed in existing text on page 2: "The findings and conclusions in this document are those of the author(s) who are responsible for its contents and do not necessarily represent the views of the Department of Veterans Affairs or the United States government. Therefore, no statement in this article should be construed as an official position of the Department of Veterans Affairs." |
| 15 | 3 | Page 6- line 20-21 "Acupuncture is a technique that is part of a larger system of care originating in China and other Asian countries dating back to the 12th century." the sentence is not very clear. The historicity of the origins of traditional Chinese medicine definitely take | We worked with the reviewer to revise this part of the introduction. |

| Comment # | Reviewer # | Comment | Author Response |
|-----------|------------|---|--|
| 16 | 3 | <p>it back farther than the 12th century, the origin of acupuncture on the other hand as originating exclusively during the Song Dynasty is also very contested.</p> <p>Page 8 paragraph "Data Sources and Searches" - Although this is later clarified in appendix a, line 5-6 appear to state that only studies from 2012 and early 2013 were included. Appendix A clarifies by stating that studies were included through 2021.</p> | This has been corrected. |
| 17 | 3 | <p>Including multiple comparators in the study instead of insisting on only "sham vs acupuncture" was very appreciated in order to capture a more robust date set.</p> | This has been corrected |
| 18 | 3 | <p>Page 9 paragraph "Synthesis" - perhaps an explanation as to why a different convention was chosen for the bubble plot in this publication versus the previous publication evidence map from 2014 would be helpful to understand the intentions of the authors. Why do the plots look so different? To the untrained reader who might try to compare the studies there would be difficulty with reconciling this? An explanation of the rationale for this choice would be appreciated.</p> | <p>We have added a sentence to explain why this is, basically to provide more and better information than was available for the older report.</p> |
| 19 | 3 | <p>Page 14 - line 20 and onward - the choice of "high certainty" is difficult to see as different than "high rate of effectiveness". This choice seems to impact the appearance of the bubble plots and the few "high certainty" studies seem to appear as if there are few conditions for which there is "high rate of effectiveness". This is clear to the academic, but difficult to glean for the casual reader in my opinion.</p> | <p>An important feature of GRADE is that the certainty of evidence is separated from the size of the effect of the intervention. Thus, bodies of evidence can report estimates of large effect but low certainty and conversely, evidence of low effect but high certainty. We have added this to the report. A review concluding "high rate of effectiveness" but with Low certainty of evidence should be considered as a conclusion for which the authors felt the true effect might be substantially different than that reported.</p> |
| 20 | 3 | <p>Page 27 - paragraph "Future Research" was very thoughtful and inclusive and will likely result in much fruitful direction for researchers in this field, this</p> | Thank you for your comment! |

| Comment # | Reviewer # | Comment | Author Response |
|-----------|------------|--|--|
| | | paragraph is an excellent contribution to the academic community. | |
| 21 | 4 | None | |
| 22 | 5 | Page 3: line 27. Requestor is from VA Central Iowa, but this request really came through Juli Olson's role in the Integrative Health Coordinating Center under the Office of Patient Centered Care & Cultural Transformation. | This has been corrected. |
| 23 | 5 | Page 6, line 11: Could this be updated to reflect the request came from the IHCC? | This has been corrected. |
| 24 | 5 | Page 10, line 6: A little confusing here because auricular acupuncture is manual. It might be better to classify between auricular and comprehensive or full-body acupuncture. Electro-acupuncture can also be done to the ear. So maybe: "For type of acupuncture, triangle denotes studies that used exclusively auricular acupuncture and circle denotes all other types of comprehensive or full body acupuncture (manual/standard, electro-acupuncture)." This also may have included auricular acupuncture in some of the studies, but I don't know if that is the case. | We have made the change to clarify the definition for the type of acupuncture in text. |
| 25 | 5 | Page 16, Figure 2: Suggest changing the title of bubble "Hormone therapy - Related SE in Br Ca" to "Related SE in Br Ca associated with hormone therapy" because the table reads "Benefit for acupuncture...Hormone therapy" acupuncture is not effective for hormone therapy, it is effective for the SE. Then it would read "Benefit for acupuncture...Related SE in Br Ca..." | This has been corrected. |
| 26 | 5 | Page 16, Figure 2: "dental surgical pain" is post-operative? There is a tradition of doing dental surgery with acupuncture over other anesthesia so reader might think of that. Perhaps "Post-Op Dental Pain" | This has been corrected. |
| 27 | 5 | Page 22, line 30: Consider hyphenating Posttreatment (post-treatment). | This has been corrected. |

| Comment # | Reviewer # | Comment | Author Response |
|-----------|------------|--|--|
| 28 | 5 | Page 27, line 51: This is a very helpful statement, thank you: "Studies comparing acupuncture to placebo or sham are probably not the priority, rather the priority should be studies comparing acupuncture to other recommended/accepted/active therapies for the condition." | Thank you for your comment! |
| 29 | 5 | Page 28: This is a helpful comment about the state of the literature: "This seems to be a mismatch between resources and need. The field of acupuncture would be best moved forward with resources devoted to producing more high quality RCTs and producing fewer new systematic reviews." | Thank you for your comment! |
| 30 | 5 | Question about depression and the Smith review. Table 4 on page 22 lists the results from the study about risks rather than symptomatic improvement for depression: "It is unclear whether there are differences in the risk of adverse events between persons receiving acupuncture or sham acupuncture" But the study concludes: "We found low-quality evidence suggesting that acupuncture (manual and electro-) may moderately reduce the severity of depression by end of treatment (SMD -0.66, 95% CI -1.06 to -0.25, five trials, 488 participants)." Depression ended up in the evidence map as no benefit or harm from acupuncture. I am confused here. | Because the effectiveness conclusions from that review were rated as Low certainty of evidence and the adverse events conclusion was Moderate certainty of evidence, the Low certainty conclusion never made it to the evidence map because the columns are mutually exclusive. We have solved this problem by splitting out all conclusions about adverse events into their own map, thus leaving the main maps to be only about effectiveness outcomes, and now that review does enter as one where all conclusions were rated as Low or Very Low. |
| 31 | 5 | In the evidence maps did anything end up in the "No benefit or harm" category due to harm? I appreciated the review assessing risk and harm for acupuncture, but maybe it would be helpful to spell out that there is no study that was put in that category to do the findings of harm. Could that category even be updated to "no benefit" since none showed harm? | We have now split out the adverse events/harms into their own map, and the main maps are now just "benefit" vs. "no benefit". |